A bibliometric review of Immigrant and Ethnic Entrepreneurship

Eduardo Picanço Cruz and Roberto Pessoa de Queiroz Falcão

AB1

Universidade Federal Fluminense, UFF/RJ, Rio de Janeiro/RJ, Brasil

Pontifícia Universidade Católica do Rio de Janeiro, PUC/RJ, Rio de Janeiro/RJ, Brasil

ARTICLE DETAILS

Article history:
Received 26 July 2016
Accepted 07 December 2016
Available online in 30 December 2016

double Blind Review System

Scientific Editor
Ilan Avrichir

Keywords:
Immigration
Immigrant Entrepreneurship
Ethnic Entrepreneurship
Ethnic Enclave

ABSTRACT

Debate about the immigration of thousands of refugees to Europe and their assimilation by society and the local economy is a popular theme today. Furthermore, international entrepreneurship of ethnic enclaves has been studied as a form of social mobility and integration of these groups. Several immigrant communities of various ethnic groups have been studied, however, the Brazilian immigrant has been little studied in relation to his/her profile, culture, and entrepreneurial behavior. Bibliometric research conducted on immigrant and ethnic entrepreneurship points to a change in its original focus on “enclave economies,” “ethnic business,” and “social embeddedness” to studies related to “immigrant entrepreneurs,” “immigrant business networks,” and “transnational entrepreneurs.” This article aims to present the results of a bibliometric study, contemplating seminal works, the main international theories on immigrant entrepreneurship, and ethnic enclaves. Moreover, gaps in Brazilian and international literature are also identified in order to systematically expand this field of research. The authors present an analysis of concepts, theories, and the most cited articles in this study field, as well as pointing to possible future research directions.

© 2016 Internext | ESPM. All rights reserved!

1. Introduction

The aim of this study is to contribute to the expansion of research on immigrant entrepreneurship in its international dimension, and points to new research forms.

The debate regarding immigration is increasingly relevant and present in international media, both because of the great movement of Syrian and Africans refugees seeking asylum in Europe as well as the controversial discourse of the U.S. presidential candidate Donald Trump, who has emphasized the Mexican issue in the United States.

What these events have brought to light is a negative emphasis on the migration phenomenon, since the main concern of world leaders is how to host this large number of people who left their history—including material goods, studies, and job—to arrive in receiving countries with an eagerness to rebuild their lives.

Some studies on immigration highlight a specific angle of the issue, denoting the positive impact of entrepreneurship in generating income and social mobility. Examples described in the international literature such as Cuban refugees in Miami, Dominicans in New York, Chinese in U.S. Chinatowns, among others, reinforce the importance and topicality of the subject (e.g., Portes & Zhou, 1992; Zhou, 2004).

However, national literature still lacks texts on immigrant entrepreneurship. Research on Brazilian entrepreneurs abroad is almost non-existent, even though the total early-stage entrepreneurial activity (TEA) of Brazil is 39.3%, according to the 2015 Global Entrepreneurship Monitor (GEM), which means that 52 million individuals between 18 and 64 years old

1 Contato do autor: E-mail: robertopqfalcao@gmail.com

© 2016 Internext | ESPM. All rights reserved!
DOI:10.18568/1980-4865.11378-94
are engaged in entrepreneurial activities (GEM, 2016).

The Brazilian migration phenomenon in several countries began in the 1980s due to the severe economic crisis that devastated the country. Several studies agree with this, varying only in destination: Japan (Assisi & Sasaki, 2000), United States (Margolis, 2003), and Portugal (Vitorio, 2007), for example. The issue was so evident that, in 2005, the Brazilian government created a Joint Parliamentary Committee of Inquiry to better investigate the phenomenon, showing the importance of the subject.

The international literature has two recent bibliometric studies on the subject, held by Ma, Zhao, Wang, and Li (2013) and Aliaga-Isla and Rialp (2013). The first points to the main topics of immigrant entrepreneurship discussed so far. According to the authors, the debate focuses on “immigrant entrepreneurs,” “immigrant business networks,” and “transnational entrepreneurs.”

The second article gives evidence that most studies on immigrant entrepreneurship have focused on communities established in the United States, followed by Europe and Oceania, which demonstrates the need for national research. Also, these authors identified that the study had an important individual level of analysis and a deductive perspective. According to the analysis, there is a lack of theory and qualitative study in this field, as well as research gaps related to immigrant entrepreneurship from Latin America, Asia, or the BRICs.

The authors also point out that there are only a few comparative studies, which is important as both the context in which immigrant entrepreneurs are placed and their cultures influence results. Thus, they emphasize the need to carry out more studies on the characteristics of each immigrant population, their entrepreneurship, and the comparison between the two.

Reviewing national literature indicates other gaps. Martes and Rodriguez (2004) mention the opportunities of studying Brazilian communities abroad as well as the significant number of foreign immigrants that come to Brazil.

This article focuses on studies about immigrant entrepreneurship, ethnic entrepreneurship, capital theories, and ethnic enclaves from national and international literature. The objective was to revisit the subject, including a database of 183 new international studies, published after the bibliometric studies mentioned.

2. Methodology

A bibliometric study was held that sought to limit bias, in order to allow it to be replicated in future studies (Jones, Coviello, & Tang, 2011), producing a scientific summary of the evidence of this area of knowledge (Petticrew, 2006).

The purpose of this methodological rigidity and breakdown of procedures is based on some principles highlighted by Thorpe et al. (2005): transparency, clarity, focus, unifying research, researchers related to the subject from around the world, equality, accessibility, wide coverage, and generating a summary.

To conduct this study the following criteria was considered, in accordance with Aliaga-Isla and Rialp (2013): (i) the international definition of immigrant entrepreneurship (Chaganti & Greene, 2002; Sasse & Thielemann, 2005); (ii) the scope of entrepreneurship (Acs, Audretsch, & Evans, 1994; Vinogradov & Kolvereid, 2007; Wennekers et al., 2003); (iii) only the English language, due to its importance as the main language in databases and international journals, and Portuguese language, due to the need to find articles in national databases; (iv) the quality of the articles published, selecting those with the highest number of citations; (v) empirical and conceptual articles; (vi) multidisciplinarity, covering areas of business, management, entrepreneurship, sociology, and urban studies, where the subject of "immigrant entrepreneurship" has been more studied by various branches of applied social sciences.

The selection of articles followed this sequence:

a) Keywords: the words chosen are directly related to the terms “empreendedorismo,” “imigrante,” “étnico,” "immigrant," "entrepreneurship," and "ethnic."

Boolean operators—AND, OR, NOT, or AND NOT—were used with these main keywords, combined in different ways to modify the search results and improve its refinement.

b) Searches in the Brazilian scientific journal databases of ANPAD (the National Association of Graduation and Research in Administration); CAPES (Coordination for
higher Education Staff Development); SPELL (Scientific Periodicals Electronic Library); and SciELO (Scientific Electronic Library Online) for journal articles on immigrant entrepreneurship were undertaken, in order to identify the status of Brazilian research on the subject. The articles found were quantified and analyzed according to their topics.

c) Search in the Web of Science database for articles from international literature, using keywords and thematic filters, to rank journals and identify the respective impact factors. Besides being robust and comprehensive, its use facilitates statistical analysis of the number of citations of both authors and articles. As it will be shown that the issue begins in the 1980s, a time frame was not used and articles published on any date were considered.

In the Web of Science database, the initial result included 906 articles. The articles were filtered to enhance this first search by highlighting the following research areas: "business economics," "sociology," "geography," "demography," "urban studies," and "social sciences other topics." The objective of this procedure was to exclude areas that are not related with this study. Articles unavailable electronically were also excluded (Jones, Coviello, & Tang 2011). As a result, a total of 676 articles were reached.

d) Quantitative analysis of the 676 items, involving the identification of the number of articles published per year, the relationship of 30 journals with at least five publications on the subject, the 40 most cited articles, the 20 main authors and, finally, the generation of "word clouds" from the titles of the oldest articles (1980s and 1990s) and the 121 most recent, published after the bibliometric reviews of Ma, Zhao, Wang, and Li (2013) and Aliaga-Isla and Rialp (2013).

e) Qualitative analysis with a detailed reading of the 40 most cited articles in order to identify key concepts and relevant theories to the study of immigrant and ethnic entrepreneurship. Analysis of the lines of research of the 20 international authors who published the most on the subject.

In relation to the limitations inherent in the theme and method, two challenges to this study were identified that can be understood as limitations. The first one refers to the context of the subject immigrant entrepreneurship, which has been studied in several disciplines and is often found as ethnic or minority entrepreneurship, including immigrants (Masurel & Nijkamp, 2004). The second challenge was dealing with the multidisciplinary nature of the subject, which generated the necessity of analyzing the selected articles from different perspectives and paradigms. Aliaga and Rialp (2013) point out similar limitations in their bibliometric study on the subject.

3. Results

Focusing on immigrants means having as a study sample of first generation foreign individuals, established in a certain country other than their own. This concept differs from the co-ethnics, who are born in the receiving country but are not the first generation. In addition to this definition, immigrants are people who have been out of their country of origin for at least 12 months (Sasse & Thielemann, 2005).

3.1 Immigrant entrepreneurship in Brazilian publications

The survey carried out in national journals databases helps to reveal the gap in the subject. Searching for peer-reviewed journal articles on ANPAD’s (macro-areas of administration) website, when the expression "immigrant" was typed only seven references appeared. In the texts actually related to what was being sought, only two case studies of Chinese immigrants in Brazil were found (Carvalho, Silva, & Yen-Tsang, 2015; Oliveira, 2007).

The combination of the two keywords "entrepreneurship" and "immigrant" was searched, using the Boolean operator AND in the databases of SPELL and CAPES. In CAPES database, the result was an article published by Weinberg (2004) in Saeculum – Revista de História.

In the SPELL database, from the nine articles found, only one was related to the subject, addressing transnationalism and entrepreneurial behavior (Oliveira & Iglesias, 2012). From those that had no relation to the subject, five articles were found related to tourism and its relationship with colonization by European immigrants and two others
unrelated to the topic. The searched term "immigrant" in SPELL resulted in four articles from which two were related to the subject: one by Oliveira and Iglesias (2012) and another by Martes and Rodriguez (2004). Thus, the initial hypothesis, that there is scarce scientific production in the national context related to the topic of immigrant entrepreneurship, was validated.

The article on transnationalism and entrepreneurial behavior (Oliveira & Iglesias, 2012) aimed to be an exploratory study to verify a possible relationship between the behavior of immigrants from transnational families with the behavior of entrepreneurial individuals. The discourse of an Egyptian immigrant resident in Spain was analyzed; however, due to the lack of a robust methodology the results are inconclusive.

In Martes and Rodrigues (2004), the relations between ethnic entrepreneurship and religion in North American immigrant communities are discussed. The analysis is based on interviews with North American Brazilian communities. It points to the fact that Protestant churches create a more favorable environment for ethnic entrepreneurship—"prosperity theology"—in opposition to the Catholic churches in the United States, which promotes "liberation theology." Another interesting issue is the difficulties faced in the field research when obtaining data from such groups, which could explain the fact that it is an under-researched area in administration and entrepreneurship (Raijman, 2001). Therefore, the authors suggested, in 2004, that future work should focus on developing alternative ways to obtain data on ethnic immigrant populations, and the need of expanding the field.

3.2. Ethnic entrepreneurship in Brazilian publications

Being an exclusive database for administration, by using only the term "ethnic" in ANPAD’s search engine no results were found. In the CAPES journal database, the combination of the keywords "entrepreneurship" and "ethnic using the Boolean operator AND resulted in 10 articles. A more detailed analysis of these texts considered only two of these works relevant: Truzzi and Neto (2007) and Halter (2007), both published in the Brazilian Journal of Business Administration (Revista de Administração de Empresas—RAE). The first relates to the ethnic economy and entrepreneurship according to the history of São Paulo immigration. The second is of a more theoretical and editorial nature, from an invited foreign author, about the importance of the ethnic economy.

In SPELL, the search for "entrepreneurship" and "ethnic" using the Boolean operator AND results in three articles: the already described works by Truzzi and Neto (2007) and Martes and Rodriguez (2004), and an article that relates to the subject, written by Nakahata and Teixeira (2014) on the creation of business by Japanese immigrants in Parana.

3.3 Immigrant and ethnic entrepreneurship in international publications

The Web of Science database is currently one of the important sources of scientific/academic research, surpassing one billion searchable references in 2015. A broad initial search of the terms related to the subject were chosen. A search with a combination of the keywords "immigrant entrepreneurship" and "ethnic" was carried out using the Boolean operator OR. It resulted in 906 articles.

Resuming the first limitation of the research presented in the methodology section, refining the search for the following research areas was decided on: "business economics", "sociology", "geography", "demography", "urban studies", "ethnics studies", "social sciences other topics" It resulted in 676 articles, which were treated as the initial sample of the bibliometric study.

As seen, even in the international literature, immigrant or ethnic entrepreneurship is relatively new compared to other topics of administration. The increase in scientific production consistently occurred from the 1990s.
Using the ranking tool from the database, a list was generated of all the journals in which the 676 articles were published. Thus, the journals were arranged from the biggest to the smallest number of articles published, with the first 30 journals shown in Table 1.

**Tab. 1**
Number of articles in the 30 journals with the most publications on the subject

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Journals</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>International Migration Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Ethnic and Racial Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Entrepreneurship and Regional Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Urban Geography</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Urban Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>International Migration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Small Business Economics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>American Sociological Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>International Journal of Urban and Regional Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Sociological Perspectives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Environment and Planning A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Social Forces</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Annals of the Association of American Geographers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Social Science Research</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Geographical Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Identities-Global Studies in Culture and Power</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>International Business Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Sociological Quarterly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Tidschrift Voor Economische en Sociale Geografie</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>American Behavioral Scientist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Canadian Journal of Economics-Revue Canad. D Economique</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Ethnicities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Human Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Journal of American Ethnic History</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Journal of Northeast Asian Studies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Journal of Urban Economics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Population Space and Place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Regional Studies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Source:* Elaborated by the authors using the search tool Web of Science.

As a complement to this step, a study of word frequency was used for the titles of the 676 articles published. From the free software available on the Internet, Tagul’s (www.tagul.com) cluster tool was chosen to accomplish this task, generating the results shown in Tab 2.

For qualitative analysis, the 40 most cited articles (see Tab 3) were identified. Then, key concepts were extracted, which will be detailed in Section 4.2 of this article. A greater concentration in urban studies, geography, business, human resources, and sociology was noted.

The authors who contributed most to the development of this field of study through their publications were identified. In the 676 articles that were part of the total population of the bibliometric study, a total of 939 authors were found. From these, 84.7%, or 796 researchers, contributed with only one work on the subject, which shows that the field is emerging and still dispersed, perhaps because of its multidisciplinary characteristic.

This interpretation gained strength when it was verified that only 20 authors participated in five or more articles from the databases surveyed, as shown in Tab 4.

### 3.4 Early studies

With respect to the first publications that appeared in international journals, it was found that they are from the 1980s and mainly focused on ethnic enclaves and gradually moving toward an entrepreneurial perspective, as shown in Tab 5. At first, the field emerged from sociological studies, which can be corroborated by analyzing the journals of the first publications.

The journals were distributed in sociology, ethnic studies, and migration journals: *AJS, ASR, IMR, JAEH, JDA, JES, JUH, SP, and EU.*

---

*Source:* Elaborated by the authors through the Tagul.com’s cluster tool.
A bibliometric review of Immigrant and Ethnic Entrepreneurship

The study of word frequency in the titles of the 112 articles published in the 1980s and 1990s generated a result that indicates the most recurrent themes.

A review of the articles’ abstracts suggests that the debate on immigrant entrepreneurship appears as a result of ethnic studies. An evaluation of word frequency indicates a timid presence of the term “entrepreneurship.” Another point concerns the geographical areas or ethnic groups initially surveyed: Chinese, Cuban, Asian, New York, and Los Angeles.

4. Discussion

4.1 Main topics discussed in the seminal articles

This section contextualizes the various themes or seminal works that influenced directly or indirectly the immigrant entrepreneurship theme. First, some seminal works on the internationalization of business are presented, followed by capital types, immigrant entrepreneurship, transnationalism, and ethnic enclave theories. The 40 most cited articles in the database searched were used for this end.
### Tab. 4
Authors with the greatest number of works published

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th># N</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>University Department</th>
<th>Main Subjects</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Johnston, Ron</td>
<td>Reino Unido</td>
<td>Faculdade de Ciências Geográficas da Universidade de Bristol</td>
<td>Ethnical segregation, cultural assimilation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Forrest, James</td>
<td>Austrália</td>
<td>Departamento de Geografia Humana da Macquarie University</td>
<td>and ethnical enclaves</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Poulsen, Michael</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Kwon, Seok-Woo</td>
<td>EUA</td>
<td>Estratégica da Fox School of Business na Temple University</td>
<td>Social capital among immigrants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Boyd, Robert L.</td>
<td>EUA</td>
<td>Professor de sociologia na Mississipi State University</td>
<td>Ethnical economies, retail among immigrants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Alba, Richard D</td>
<td>EUA</td>
<td>Distinguished Professor do Graduate Center Universidad de Nova York</td>
<td>Developed the assimilation theory to adjust to the contemporary, multiracial era of immigration. With studies in America, France and Germany.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Wang, Qingfang</td>
<td>EUA</td>
<td>Professora de política pública na Universidade da Califórnia - Riverside.</td>
<td>Immigration, race, ethnicity entrepreneurship and transactional migration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Fong, Eric</td>
<td>Canadá</td>
<td>Professor de Sociologia da Universidade de Toronto</td>
<td>Currently examines immigrants’ firms in small and big cities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Logan, JR</td>
<td>EUA</td>
<td>Departamento de Sociologia da Universidade de Albany - NY</td>
<td>Ethnical economies in big cities: Miami, NY, and Los Angeles</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Portes, Alejandro</td>
<td>EUA</td>
<td>Dep. de Sociologia, Universidade de Princeton</td>
<td>Immigrant entrepreneurship, social capital and economic mobility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Zhou, M</td>
<td>EUA</td>
<td>Professora de Sociologia e estudos do Asian American na UCLA</td>
<td>International migration, ethnical and racial relations and immigrant entrepreneurship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Nijkamp, Peter</td>
<td>Holanda</td>
<td>Prof. de Econômia Regional e Urbana e Geografia Economica na VU University - Amsterdam</td>
<td>Ethnical business people and urban economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Chen, Wenhong</td>
<td>EUA</td>
<td>Universidade do Texas</td>
<td>Social capital, networks and entrepreneurship among immigrants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Clark, Ken</td>
<td>Reino Unido</td>
<td>Escola de Economia da Univ. de Manchester</td>
<td>Migration and self-employment in United Kingdom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Li, Peter S.</td>
<td>Canadá</td>
<td>Professor de sociologia Univ. de Saskatchewan</td>
<td>Race and ethnicity, immigration, Chinese in Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Light, Ivan</td>
<td>EUA</td>
<td>Prof. Emérito Dept. de Sociologia - UCLA</td>
<td>Immigration, entrepreneurship and urban sociology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Liu, Cathy Yang</td>
<td>EUA</td>
<td>Escola de Estudos Políticos Univ. Estadual da Georgia</td>
<td>Ethnical segregation, ethnical entrepreneurship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Nee, Victor</td>
<td>EUA</td>
<td>Departamento de Sociologia Cornell University</td>
<td>Economic sociology, network roles and economic institutions norms and organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Razin, Eran</td>
<td>Israel</td>
<td>Dept. de Geografia - Hebrew University of Jerusalem</td>
<td>Ethnical entrepreneurs in USA and Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Sanders, JM</td>
<td>EUA</td>
<td>Prof. de Sociologia Univ. da Carolina do Sul</td>
<td>Social capital and human solidarity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Elaborated by the authors through the search tool Web of Science

### Tab. 5
Early studies on immigrant/ethnic entrepreneurship

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Titles</th>
<th>Authors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1982</td>
<td>Ethnic Enclaves: A Comparison of the Cuban and Black Economies in Miami</td>
<td>Wilson, Kl; Martin, Wa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>Ethics and Enclaves - Bosstownians North-End - Demarco, WM</td>
<td>Briggs, Jw</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1984</td>
<td>Forward and Backward Linkages in a Plantation Economy - Immigrant Entrepreneurship and Industrial- Development in Yucatan, Mexico</td>
<td>Baklanoff, En; Brannon, Jr</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>A Comparative Perspective on the Ethnic Enclave - Blacks, Italians, and Jews in New-York-City</td>
<td>Model, S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985</td>
<td>Ethics and Enclaves - Bosstownians North-End - Demarco, WM</td>
<td>Baily, Sl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>Ethnic Enclaves and Middleman Minorities - Alternative Strategies of Immigrant Adaptation</td>
<td>Cobas, Ja</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>Does Self-Esteem Affect Educational Aspirations - The Case of the Ethnic Enclave</td>
<td>Yogev, A; Ilan, Y</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>Women, Work and Ethnic-Identity - Personal Narratives and the Ethnic Enclave in the Textile City of Lowell, Massachusetts</td>
<td>Norkunas, Mk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>Making It in America - a Social Evaluation of the Ethics of Immigrant Entrepreneurship</td>
<td>Bonacich, E</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>Limits of Ethnic Solidarity in the Enclave Economy</td>
<td>Sanders, Jm; Nee, V</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Elaborated by the authors through the search tool Web of Science
A bibliometric review of Immigrant and Ethnic Entrepreneurship

4.1.1 Assimilation and self-employment theory

The seminal article by Portes and Zhou (1992) seeks to demonstrate how leaving the enclave and cultural assimilation of co-ethnics may have a negative effect on the gains of this group, as by leaving the enclaves they no longer enjoy networks with social capital, henceforth engaging in job competition in an open market. The authors analyze their hypothesis and compare various ethnic communities. Later, Portes and Zhou (1996) also study the issue of economic returns of immigrants involved in “self-employment.”

An article by Evans and Leighton (1989) discusses why some immigrant groups are more likely to be entrepreneurs than others in Australia. Based on organizational ecology, the author argues that a certain immigrant group represents an economic niche for small businesses. Large groups provide an even more favorable niche for ethnic entrepreneurs. Lower fluency in the local language can also create more closed ethnic niches in which co-ethnic employees are better accepted.

Alba and Logan (1993) analyze two complementary theoretical models: spatial assimilation and stratification by location. The researchers applied their study in suburban communities in New York starting from 1980. Although there is less segregation in suburbs than central areas of cities, the authors found significant differences between racial/ethnic groups, concerning the level of segregation of non-Hispanic white and black groups. Alba and Nee (1997) present the assimilation and acculturation of immigrant theory and propose a revision of Gordon’s (1964) concepts in order to fill causality gaps. This is the most cited article of the whole sample on the subject. Ethnic issues and inequalities are also addressed by Waters and Eschbach (1995).

Fairlie and Meyer (1996) show evidence that self-employment rates substantially differ among the 60 ethnic and racial groups in the United States. They also create a hypothesis about positive association between self-employment rates of an ethnic/racial group and the difference between the average income of this group generated by ‘self-employment’ and through wage employment. Despite what was assumed—that the discrimination and difficulties in learning the local language would lead to increases in “self-employment”—in fact, in many cases economic gains make up the main decisive factor for engaging in entrepreneurial activities, according to the authors. This study is complemented by Clark and Drinkwater (2000) from the United Kingdom. More recently, research including groups such as the Cubans in Miami, African-Americans, Puerto Ricans, Koreans, Dominicans, Chinese, Mexicans, and Salvadorans differ regarding the possible positive association between “self-employment” rates and the economic success of an ethnic group (Logan, Alba, & Stults, 2003).

In addition to discussion on entrepreneurship or “self-employment” as a survival mechanism for certain ethnic groups, the issue of gender in entrepreneurship is debated by Loscocco and Robinson (1991). However, some factors tend to make small businesses owned by women less successful than those owned by men, which is addressed by the authors.

On the other hand, the study by Nee, Sanders, and Sernau (1994) points out that some immigrants tend to move away from the under-employment of the more informal ethnic economy, looking for formal jobs outside the enclave.

Barrett, Jones, and McEvoy (1996) focus their study on ethnic minority entrepreneurship in Great Britain and North America. The authors show high “self-employment” rates, between 11% and 14.9% for certain ethnic minority groups, and business promotion mechanisms by these minorities.

Iceland (2004) studies trend of racial and ethnic residential segregation across the United States in the period 1980-2000, confirming through statistical analysis that diversity increased, while segregation changed very little. Another article, by Johnston, Poulsen, and Forrest (2007), addresses geographic

---

Tab. 6
Frequency of words in the titles of the 112 articles published in the 1980s and 1990s

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>WORDS</th>
<th>1980 to 1990</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ethnic</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Immigrant</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enclave</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entrepreneurship</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinese</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>York</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fonte: Elaborated by the authors through the Tagul.com's cluster tool
residential segregation through a comparative study of five English-speaking countries.

4.1.2 Ethnic enclaves

Logan, Alba, and Zhang (2002) show in their article the influx of ethnic groups that leave ethnic enclaves to live in suburban neighborhoods that are traditionally dominated by the white American population. The authors study fifteen ethnic groups in neighborhoods concentrated in New York and Los Angeles, showing their spatial location patterns and variables that influence the choice of the housing location. The authors confirm that the choice of the enclave’s location is not only associated with financial constraints. While for some groups enclaves may be a destination, seeking greater assimilation, for others they are only a temporary location until financial conditions improve.

When carrying out a comparative analysis of companies owned by Cuban and black in Miami, Wilson and Martin (1982) observed a relative advantage of certain ethnic enclaves, suggesting that the Cuban enclave benefits the most as it is characterized by highly interdependent industries.

In the article by Sanders and Nee (1987), immigrant mechanisms of social and economic adaptation to life in the United States are also.

According to the authors, Portes and other researchers advance, in the “enclave economy” hypothesis—which contradicts the classical view of assimilation—that segregation would slow economic progress and the social mobility of minorities. When studying Cuban and Chinese immigrants, the authors suggest that the classic hypothesis of enclaves is supported only in the case of entrepreneurs; however, an assimilation perspective better explains the increase in earnings of employees who are employed outside the enclave, showing differences between gains and the assimilation of “immigrant-workers” and “immigrant-bosses.”

Portes and Jensen (1989) discuss four hypotheses about the characteristics and the consequences of participating in an ethnic enclave economy: The first is based on place of residence; the second and third on the effects of participating in an ethnic economy for entrepreneurs and workers; and the fourth on the determinants factors of “self-employment” among ethnic minorities. Consistent results contradict the concept of ethnic businesses being a means of labor exploitation and enclaves as mere residential agglomerations, demonstrating the rise of a business minority and the influence of family structure and females in the establishment of ethnic businesses.

Waldinger (1993) revisits the ethnic enclave topic, referring to the seminal works by Portes about Cubans in Miami.

Portes and Schauffler (1994) point out the formation of linguistic enclaves in several American cities, exploring the extent of language transition and the resilience of immigrant languages, based on data from the south of Florida.

According to Light et al. (1994), the terms “ethnic economy” and “ethnic enclave economy” mean immigrant businesses, of ethnic minorities, or the employment sector coexisting with the local market. Despite often being treated as synonymous, the authors clarify that the “ethnic enclave economy” derives from literature on labor segmentation, whereas “ethnic economy” derives from literature on intermediate minorities. From these concepts, an intense debate emerges about the salaries of workers of the ethnic enclave versus the general economy.

Logan et al. (1994) also analyze the ethnic market in seventeen metropolitan areas. Five Asian groups (Japanese, Chinese, Koreans, Philippines, and Indians) and three Hispanic groups (Cubans, Mexican, and Puerto Ricans) are compared to non-Hispanic whites and blacks. The authors found minority business concentration mainly in sectors with low salaries, low capitalization, low levels of unionization, and high proportions of female workers. The enclaves are based on a combination of making clothes and ethnic cuisine.

Waldinger (1995) says that there is a growing interest in researching entrepreneurial activities of different ethnicities. According to the author, the inclusion of a business in an ethnic network or community leads to cooperation among ethnic economic agents, preventing access from outsiders.

Another interesting and often cited study by Scandinavian researchers (Åslund, Edin, & Fredriksson, 2000) analyzes the Swedish public policy of dispersing refugees as a natural experiment, showing evidence that those living in enclaves improve their earnings.

Zhou (2004) revises ethnic entrepreneurship theories and concepts from the last thirty years. First, she studies the meaning of intermediate minorities,
the ethnic economy, and the enclave economy, arguing that the social ethnic structures in which entrepreneurs are embedded should be researched. The author mentions convergences and controversies in research on entrepreneurship, its causes and consequences, and emphasizes two interrelated conceptual advances in the study of ethnic entrepreneurship: transnationalism versus entrepreneurship, and the synergy of entrepreneurship with the construction of a community.

The spatial issue of concentration of certain ethnic groups is also addressed by some British authors, such as Atkinson (2006) and Ellis, Wright, and Parks (2004). The first seeks explanations for segregation by different income factors, such as social and institutional discrimination. The second presents a different perspective, revealing a false impression of ethnic areas, which are considered fixed in a city, mistakenly characterizing neighborhoods as the domain of those who live there instead of those who work there. Other studies discuss the residential segregation of ethnic groups in urban areas as an important issue for policy-making in multicultural societies such as England (Johnston, Forrest, & Poulsen, 2002) and Canada (Walks & Bourne, 2006).

4.1.3 Transnationalism

Portes, Guarnizo, and Haller (2002) discuss immigrant transnationalism as an alternative form of economic adaptation by ethnic minorities, based on the use of their transnational social networks. According to the authors, although immigrant transnationalism has received little attention in mainstream sociological literature, it has the potential to change the character of new ethnic communities generated by contemporary immigration. This empirical existence of transnationalism is observed by the authors, based on discriminant characteristics of immigrants and the relative probability of them engaging in these types of activities.

4.1.4 Theories of capital and their influence on the formation of immigrant communities

Other interesting dimensions to be analyzed in the entrepreneurship sphere are the “types of capital”: “economic capital,” “human capital,” and “social capita” (Bourdieu, 2011). The notion of “economic capital” is well known and is related to financial resources to start a business as well as their origin (their own or third-party). But, in ethnic enclaves there are many alternative financing mechanisms, as shown by Portes and Zhou (1992) and Basu (1998).

Human capital refers to investment in education, professional experience, and job skills (Becker, 1964). Thus, this dimension can be expressed both by the level of education and the knowledge acquired from previous work or even business experiences.

Social capital, in turn, according to Ndofor and Priem (2011), is related to the professional network of the immigrant entrepreneur, including other entrepreneurs, suppliers, service providers, and even competitors. This dimension will be further explored and detailed.

According to Martes and Rodriguez (2004), several authors suggest that one of the most important resources that ethnic and immigrant communities have is their social capital, which are often associated with higher rates of business success (Light, 1972; Light & Bonacich, 1988; Portes, 1987; Putnam et al., 1993). Still, according to Martes and Rodriguez (2004) and Light (1998), this primary relationship between social capital and ethnic entrepreneurship is due to the use of some elements of the social capital, such as solidarity, ethical and cultural values, knowledge, and skills. Ethnic entrepreneurs minimize risks by building cooperation mechanisms, even if in some cases they compete. It shows the strengthened reliance among individuals of the same ethnicity (Portes & Sensenbrenner, 1993) and the possibility of exploiting a particular consumer market, with privileged access to raw materials and ethnic workers.

Sanders and Nee (1996) observe how self-employment among Asian and Latin Americans immigrants is affected by the composition of the family and human capital resources, with collective interests and strong family ties facilitating leverage over resources. Immigrant entrepreneurs fall back upon these resources when creating and operating their small businesses. Subsequently, the authors carried out another study (Nee & Sanders, 2001), developing an immigrant incorporation model based on capital types. It establishes the way by which social, financial, and human-cultural capital of immigrant families generates possible trajectories in the job market. For example, immigrants with low financial and cultural capital are more likely to be employed in the ethnic economy, while immigrants...
with higher human and cultural capital can obtain a job in the formal economy. The research is based on a field study of Asian immigrants in Los Angeles. Sanders (2002) goes beyond the issue of the use of social capital derived from ethnic networks and identities. The author focuses on how these interpersonal networks, within ethnic communities, influence their degree of enclosure and ethnic identity.

This discussion is complemented by the work of Basu (1998), where the author talks about the establishment of small Asian businesses in Great Britain by well-educated entrepreneurs with great entrepreneurial spirit. It points out the potential role of banks and government agencies in encouraging the creation of these small businesses in the country.

Levitt (1998) addresses the issue of the so-called “social remittances,” a form of cultural diffusion related to migration—ideas, behaviors, identities, and social capital—which arise from the relationship between host communities and countries of origin. These remittances have a recognized importance for immigrant entrepreneurship and the transformation of local communities.

Nijcamp (2003), in a broader perspective on entrepreneurship, shows urban areas as a favorable place for the incubation of innovative projects, resulting from economic density and opportunities created by the city. Although informal networks between businesses—such as in ethnic niches, for example—can be beneficial to economic performance, according to the author, the modern entrepreneur tends to increasingly become an operator and manager of a creative network. Dobrev and Barnett (2005) study how the individual role of the entrepreneur influences the process of establishing a business, either accelerating or slowing it down.

Regarding the impact of education on entrepreneurship, the study of Van der Sluis et al. (2008) shows a positive and significant effect; however, the authors say that there are only minor effects on the income of Europeans compared to American entrepreneurs, which are higher for women than for men, and lower for non-whites and immigrants.

5. Considerations

The aim of this study was to contribute to the expansion of research on immigrant entrepreneurship, inspiring new ways for research.

Through a general bibliometric analysis of themes and word frequency of the 676 articles surveyed, it was noted that the subject of immigrant entrepreneurship has a strong dependence on sociological theories. This can be proved by at least three factors identified in the work: the analysis of the topics researched, the list of journals with the highest number of publications, and the list that contains the most cited works. However, given its multidisciplinary nature, opportunities arise in the various macro areas of administration (companies, strategy, human resources, and marketing), contributing to the discussion of the subject. The progress experienced in recent years by the management science can add not only academic but also management value to the studies presented so far.

In the case of this article, given the little national research on the topic, the academic contribution is in the presentation of the discussion of the various international studies that may subsidize research on Brazilian immigrant communities and immigrant communities in Brazil. In this respect, it is emphasized that the present study updates the works of Aliaga-Isla and Rialp (2013) and Ma, Zhao, Wang, and Li (2013), as well as adding analysis on national academic literature.

Regarding the management contribution, it is necessary to point out that Brazilian communities abroad is still experiencing its first decades of occupation. Thus, through comparison with other immigrants or ethnic communities, it is possible to glimpse pathways to entrepreneurship, small-business management abroad, or even recommend international public policies.

With respect to the geographical location of the studies, as demonstrated by Aliaga-Isla and Rialp (2013), most of the articles have focused on developed countries; however, immigration occurs in other contexts, which moves us to emerging economies. This includes immigrant flows from developed countries moving to emerging countries, and also flows from one emerging country to another, which represent new research opportunities.
Even in the case of studies on immigrant communities conducted mostly in developed countries, this review points out a predominance of research in North America than Europe. Given increasing refugee influxes to Europe, this issue becomes urgent.

Even though focus is now on refugees from African countries and the Middle East, Latin American populations should also be studied—and more specifically, Brazilians in Europe.

It was noted that, in general, the studies focused on specific immigrant communities. Asian communities seem to be relevant to Great Britain, the United States, Canada, and Australia, whereas Latin American communities have more importance in North American and Spanish contexts, for example. Therefore, the literature also lacks comparative studies, which would provide a broader understanding of the phenomenon, supporting the gap identified by Aliaga-Isla and Rialp (2013).

Comparative studies relate to the entrepreneurship phenomenon itself (Johnston, Poulsen, & Forrest, 2007; Portes & Zhou, 1992) or compare policies of immigrant entrepreneurship in specific countries, such as Australia (Collins, 2003), Holland (Kloosterman, 2003), or Germany (Kontos, 2003).

It is increasingly necessary to research aspects more directly connected with entrepreneurship and human capital. The first is related to the role that prior knowledge – whether through education or professional experience – has on immigrant business in the process of recognizing opportunities for each different ethnic groups and local contexts. Another is the study of how national culture traits can influence the creation of entrepreneurial opportunities.

In the same database of articles, to identify emerging themes, articles published after the two bibliometric studies cited were sought. A total of 183 works in the period between 2013 and 2016 were found to have the highest frequency of the terms "immigrant," which appears 75 times, and "ethnic," only 58 times. If compared to the frequency in the 493 articles by the end of 2012, the term "immigrant" appeared 190 times and the term "ethnic" 220 times.

Therefore, for the expansion of this field in international entrepreneurship research in Brazil, the collaboration of various Brazilian scholars is strategic—whether through perspectives of management, strategy, markets, consumer behavior, ethnic economies, among other possible topics of research. In addition, the development of lines of research related to the anthropology of the immigrant entrepreneur, marketing studies related to ethnic consumer and ethnic market behavior, ethnography of immigrant entrepreneurs, among others, are suggested. This article concludes by inviting other scholars of these areas to collaborate in future studies.

6. Referências


### About the Authors

- **Eduardo Picanço Cruz** is PhD in Chemical Engineer by the Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro (2007). Actually is associate professor from Department of Entrepreneurship and Management - STE Universidade Federal Fluminense, UFF/RJ, Niterói/RJ, Brazil. E-mail: epicanco@id.uff.br

- **Roberto Pessoa de Queiroz Falcão** is PhD in Administration from IAG / PUC / RJ. He is currently a substitute professor in the Department of Entrepreneurship and Management - UFF / RJ and professor of MBA Empreendimentos Turísticos - UFF and the Laboratory of Technology, Business Management and Environment-LATEC marketing. E-mail: robertopafalcao@gmail.com
Revisão bibliométrica no tema
Empreendedorismo Imigrante e Étnico
Eduardo Picanço CruzA e Roberto Pessoa de Queiroz FalcãoAB
AUniversidade Federal Fluminense, UFF/RJ, Niterói/RJ, Brasil
BPontifícia Universidade Católica do Rio de Janeiro, PUC/RJ, Rio de Janeiro/RJ, Brasil

DETALHES DO ARTIGO

Histórico do artigo:
Recebido em 28 de julho de 2016
Aceito em 07 de dezembro de 2016
Disponível online: 31 de dezembro de 2016
Sistema de Revisão “Double Blind Review”

Editor científico:
Ilan Avrichir

Palavras-chaves:
Imigração
Empreendedorismo imigrante
Empreendedorismo étnico
Enclave étnico

RESUMO

O debate sobre a imigração de milhares de refugiados para Europa e sua assimilação pela sociedade e economia locais, apresenta-se como um tema em voga na atualidade. Adicionalmente, o empreendedorismo internacional de enclave étnico tem sido estudado como uma das formas de mobilidade social e integração destes grupos. Diversas comunidades de imigrantes de várias etnias têm sido objeto de estudo, no entanto, o brasileiro imigrante tem sido pouco estudado quanto a seu perfil, cultura e comportamento empreendedor. As pesquisas bibliométricas realizadas dentro do tema de empreendedorismo imigrante e étnico, apontam para uma mudança em seu enfoque original em ‘economias de enclave’, ‘empresas étnicas’ e ‘enraizamento social’ para investigações relacionadas aos ‘empresários imigrantes’, às ‘redes de negócios imigrantes’ e aos ‘empresários transnacionais’. Este artigo pretende, portanto, apresentar o resultado de um estudo bibliométrico contemplando os trabalhos seminais, as principais teorias internacionais a respeito de empreendedorismo imigrante e de enclaves étnicos, assim como identificar lacunas da literatura brasileira e internacional, expandindo este campo de pesquisa. Como principais resultados, os autores apresentam uma análise de conceitos, teorias e artigos mais citados neste campo de pesquisa e apontam para possíveis caminhos futuros de investigação.

© 2016 Internext | ESPM. Todos os direitos reservados!

To cite this article:


To access this article: http://dx.doi.org/10.18568/1980-4865.11378-94